

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

STATE LOTTERY COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

	)
ALI JAAFAR,	)
Respondent.	)
	)

Tuesday  
May 7, 2019

Lottery Commission  
150 Mount Vernon Street  
Dorchester, Massachusetts

BEFORE: LAWRENCE P. MAYO, ESQ.  
Serving as Hearing Officer  
80 Washington Square, United C20  
Norwell, MA 02061

## APPEARANCES:

For the State Lottery Commission:

GREGORY M. POLIN, ESQ.  
Assistant Director and General Counsel  
CANDACE HODGE, ESQ.  
Associate General Counsel.  
The Commonwealth of Massachusetts  
State Lottery Commission  
150 Mt. Vernon Street, Suite 300  
Dorchester, MA 02125

For the Respondent:

KEVIN M. CONSIDINE, ESQ.  
Considine & Furey LLP  
One Beacon Street, 22nd floor  
Boston, MA 01901  
617 723 7200

I N D E X

<u>WITNESS</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Maureen McHugh	7/19
Paul Mandeville	11

E X H I B I T S

<u>NO.</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
1	High-Frequency Claims Prize Suspension Notice	7
2	Mr. Jaafar Claims Report	8
3	Mr. Jaafar Statistics	16
4	Greg Polin letter to Kevin Considine, 4/26/19	25
5	Email from Kevin Considine to Greg Polin, 4/26/19	25

P R O C E E D I N G S

(10:30 AM)

1  
2  
3 MR. MAYO: Good morning, everybody. My name is  
4 Larry Mayo and I am the designated hearing officer in this  
5 case, that is the case of Ali Jaafar, if I am pronouncing  
6 that property?

7 MR. JAAFAR: Yes.

8 MR. MAYO: And his prize claims suspension hearing  
9 at the Massachusetts State Lottery Commission. Today is May  
10 7, 2019. Again, we are here today in the matter of Ali  
11 Jaafar. Mr. Jaafar is appealing the decision of the  
12 Massachusetts State Lottery Commission Compliance  
13 Department's decision to impose a prize claim suspension  
14 upon him suspending his ability to claim lottery prizes with  
15 a value of \$600 or more for a period of 90 days.

16 The Lottery issued a suspension notice to  
17 Mr. Jaafar dated April 1, 2019. That suspension was imposed  
18 pursuant to the high-frequency prize winner regulation  
19 contained at 961 CMR 2.43(2). Mr. Jaafar is here today  
20 exercising his right to a director-level hearing before the  
21 prize claim suspension goes into effect. The availability of  
22 a director-level hearing is established in 961 CMR 2.43(3).  
23 The question before me is whether Mr. Jaafar is a  
24 high-frequency prize winner and whether the submission by  
25 Mr. Jaafar of at least 20 claims for Lottery prizes, each

1 with a value of at least \$1,000 within any period of 365  
2 days is factually or statistically improbable.

3 Now, this is an informal hearing. I'm going to  
4 observe the rules of evidence established in Mass. General  
5 Law Chapter 30A, Section 11. Flexible rules. The parties  
6 will have the opportunity to call and examine witnesses,  
7 introduce exhibits and cross-examine witnesses who testify,  
8 and also to submit rebuttal evidence.

9 If the Lottery's decision to suspend Mr. Jaafar is  
10 supported by the preponderance of the credible evidence,  
11 that its decision was justified, then that decision will  
12 stand. The Lottery has the burden of proof. I will allow for  
13 opening statements if the parties so choose, closing  
14 statements if the parties so choose. If there are any  
15 objections, they will either be sustained or overruled. But,  
16 again, keep in mind these are flexible rules of evidence and  
17 testimony.

18 I will have the stenographer administer oaths to  
19 all witnesses. At the close of the hearing, I will offer you  
20 each the opportunity to submit briefs. And post-hearing  
21 briefs would be due within one week after the transcript is  
22 issued by the stenographer, which I understand takes two to  
23 three weeks. Okay?

24 If there are no further questions, then I will  
25 allow the Lottery to proceed.

1           MS. HODGE: Thank you. We are here currently for  
2 this hearing pursuant to 961 CMR 2.43 concerning the  
3 high-frequency prize winner and the Lottery has defined  
4 Mr. Ali Jaafar as a high-frequency prize winner under our  
5 regulation which is a person who submits at least 20 claims  
6 for Lottery prizes over \$1,000 within a 365-day period.

7           Mr. Jaafar has claimed 651 Lottery prizes of  
8 \$1,000 or more between July 27, 2018 and January 27, 2019.  
9 The high-frequency prize winner as Mr. Jaafar is defined is  
10 defined in 961 CMR 2.03.

11           The Lottery's Compliance Department has determined  
12 that these claims -- these 651 claims are statistically or  
13 factually improbable and as a result has imposed a Lottery  
14 claim suspension for Mr. Jaafar which has not been enacted  
15 yet pursuant to this hearing.

16           The Lottery notified Mr. Jaafar April 1, 2019 that  
17 he was a suspendee. And notified him that his ability to  
18 claim Lottery prizes of \$600 or more would be suspended for  
19 a period of 90 days. We also notified Mr. Jaafar that he was  
20 entitled to a hearing, which is why we are here, and the  
21 purpose is for him to give -- for an opportunity to discuss  
22 any grievances for the suspension, provide clarification if  
23 he so chooses. If he is aggrieved by this decision, we would  
24 certainly go further and this both our opportunity to  
25 explain why we have suspended as well as Mr. Jaafar's

1 opportunity to explain why it is statistically or factually  
2 probable.

3 I have two witnesses.

4 MR. MAYO: Great. Before we call the witnesses, I  
5 would simply like to have the suspension notice marked as  
6 Exhibit 1.

7 (Exhibit 1 was marked into  
8 evidence.)

9 MR. MAYO: First witness?

10 MS. HODGE: Maureen McHugh.

11 MAUREEN MCHUGH, Sworn

12 DIRECT EXAMINATION

13 BY MS. HODGE:

14 Q Good morning. Can you state and spell your name  
15 for the record, please?

16 A Maureen McHugh. McHugh is M-c-capital H-u-g-h.

17 Q And do you work for the Lottery?

18 A Yes, I do.

19 Q What is your title?

20 A Compliance analyst.

21 Q How long have you been in that position?

22 A Since May of 2000.

23 Q Are you familiar with the high-frequency prize  
24 winner regulation?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And how did the Compliance Department come across  
2 this high-frequency prize regulation?

3 A It was based on the new regulations were enacted  
4 in July. We -- based on another list, we took a list of  
5 frequent cashers that were already producing for the  
6 Department of Revenue and IRS. Anyone that had cashed 20  
7 tickets or more worth \$1,000 or more in a calendar year was  
8 being sent over monthly to the Department of Revenue. So,  
9 that was the -- we took that list first. And we looked at  
10 that after the regulations were passed and Mr. Jaafar was  
11 one of the high-frequency cashers on that list and we looked  
12 into him more closely.

13 Q When you say you 'looked into him more closely,'  
14 what do you mean by that?

15 A We reviewed the claims that he had filed in the  
16 period between July 27, 2018 and January 27, 2019.

17 MS. HODGE: If I could introduce an exhibit, it is  
18 2.

19 MR. CONSIDINE: No objection.

20 MR. MAYO: If there is no objection, we will have  
21 the Exhibit marked at No. 2.

22 (Exhibit 2 was marked into  
23 evidence.)

24 BY MS. HODGE:

25 Q Ms. McHugh, what is this document that is in front



1 of you?

2 A This is a listing of all claims filed by  
3 Mr. Jaafar between July 27, 2018 and January 27, 2019 that  
4 had a value of \$600 or more.

5 Q Why was this document compiled?

6 A We were reviewing his claims because of the new  
7 regulation for frequent cashers.

8 Q And looking at this document, can you explain how  
9 exactly it is set forth?

10 A The first column would have the claimant's name,  
11 address and we took out his street address. And then after  
12 the address, pay date would be the day that the claim was  
13 paid. The next column is the gross, which would be the  
14 amount of the winning ticket. The net would be the amount of  
15 the check less the taxes or any other money taken out. The  
16 next column is the Lottery office that the ticket was cashed  
17 at. And then the next is the agent number, which has been  
18 blocked out. And then the next column is the name and  
19 address of the sales agent location where the ticket was  
20 purchased with the city; and then the product name is the  
21 type of Lottery ticket that was cashed. And if it is was an  
22 instant ticket, the game and book number were included.

23 Q By 'instant ticket,' what do you mean by that?

24 A A scratch ticket.

25 Q If you can turn to the last page of this, which is

1 page 11, can you tell me how many claims Mr. Jaafar made  
2 over \$1,000?

3 A 651.

4 Q And what was the total amount he received?

5 A \$1,240,905.50.

6 Q And this was between July 27, 2018 and January 27,  
7 2019?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Looking at this document, what did the Compliance  
10 Department do with this document?

11 A Well, we reviewed and look at the locations where  
12 the tickets were sold. And the frequency of the tickets that  
13 were cashed.

14 Q Why would that be important?

15 A The location where the tickets were sold were sold  
16 at all sorts of locations across the Commonwealth. Everett,  
17 Somerville, Weymouth, Watertown, Jamaica Plain and various  
18 other locations. It is not -- from what -- a normal pattern  
19 for someone that is just out playing Lottery, most people  
20 play around their own home or in the same locations.

21 MS. HODGE: I have no further questions for now.  
22 Although I would like to recall her.

23 MR. MAYO: Okay.

24 MR. CONSIDINE: Could I ask just a couple of  
25 questions?

1 MR. MAYO: You may.

2 CROSS EXAMINATION

3 BY MR. CONSIDINE:

4 Q My name is Kevin Considine, and I'm an attorney  
5 who represents Mr. Jaafar. On the column that is redacted  
6 that has 'agent number' at the top --

7 A Yup.

8 Q Does that correspond to the name in the next  
9 column over? So, for the first one, 'Daily Mart,' that is an  
10 agent, I presume?

11 A Yes. That is their number.

12 Q Okay, so that would just refer to their number.

13 A Yeah.

14 Q And I assume each location where the Lottery is  
15 sold has an agent number?

16 A Yes.

17 MR. CONSIDINE: Okay. Thank you. No further  
18 questions.

19 MS. HODGE: If I could call Paul Mandeville.

20 PAUL MANDEVILLE, Sworn

21 DIRECT EXAMINATION

22 BY MS. HODGE:

23 Q Good morning, Mr. Mandeville. If you could state  
24 and spell your name for the record, please?

25 A Paul Mandeville. M-a-n-d-e-v-i-l-l-e.

1 Q Do you work for the Lottery?

2 A I do.

3 Q What is your title?

4 A Assistant executive director in charge of  
5 Information Technology.

6 Q How long have you been in that position?

7 A Twenty-two years.

8 Q Are you familiar with the new regulations for  
9 high-frequency cashers?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And how are you familiar with that?

12 A Through discussions with the legal department.

13 Q Have you seen what was previously marked as  
14 Exhibit 2? I can give you another copy.

15 A Yes.

16 Q What is that document?

17 A This is the report of all of the claims made by  
18 Mr. Jaafar between the dates of July 27, 2018 and January  
19 27, 2019.

20 Q Did you use that document in your job?

21 A I did.

22 Q How did you use it?

23 MR. MAYO: Excuse me. Do you have any extra copies  
24 of that?

25 MS. HODGE: Of course. It is the same Exhibit 2.

1 MR. MAYO: I'm sorry. I thought -- my apologies.

2 BY MS. HODGE:

3 Q How did you use this document?

4 A I compiled -- this is a list of all of the  
5 individual claims that were made by Mr. Jaafar at all of our  
6 regional offices. So, I compiled this into separating them  
7 out by games. And specifically, we have two types of  
8 products. Draw games and instant games. Draw games are games  
9 where this an actual draw that occurs to determine the  
10 winner. Instant games are what people commonly refer to as a  
11 'scratch ticket,' in which case the winners are already  
12 determined as part of the definition of the game.

13 So, I analyzed the game, the frequency for each of  
14 the claims, and analyzed them relative to the odds and the  
15 predetermined prize payout of the instant ticket games.

16 MS. HODGE: If I can introduce Exhibit 3, please?

17 MR. MAYO: Go ahead.

18 BY MS. HODGE:

19 Q Mr. Mandeville, do you recognize this document?

20 A I do.

21 Q What is it?

22 A It is a result of an Excel spreadsheet that I used  
23 to do the analysis that I just discussed.

24 Q Can you explain what each column means on the  
25 front page of this document?

1           A       Sure. All of the data was taken either from the  
2 definition of the games or from the document that had all of  
3 Mr. Jaafar's claims. What I was concerned about, as I said,  
4 was instant games. So, the first line is relative to draw  
5 games. So, the game number column, it refers t the instant  
6 ticket game number. Whereas draw games, I just lumped all  
7 into zero.

8                   The second column is the ticket price of that  
9 particular instant game.

10                   The third column is the name of the instant game.

11                   The fourth column, Column D, is the odds of  
12 winning a prize of \$1,000 or more. As I said, the instant  
13 ticket product is a defined product so the -- when we issue  
14 an instant game, we know exactly how many winners there are  
15 at specific tiers and we can therefore determine the exact  
16 odds of winning at prize at that specific tier.

17                   Instant tickets are also produced in groupings of  
18 books, small pools, large pools and the game. So that we  
19 know exactly how many winners are spread across each one of  
20 those divisions. So, all the winners are spread evenly  
21 across the game. So, an instant game is not a random act.  
22 It is a predetermined number.

23                   So, Column D is the odds of winning a prize of  
24 \$1,000 or more, and that's determined by how many winners  
25 there are in these pools. So, in the first case, 504,000,

1 that means that the odds of winning a prize of \$1,000 or  
2 more are one in 504,000 tickets.

3 The next column is the payout for the entire game.  
4 As I said, the game is predetermined. All of the winners are  
5 already identified. If all the tickets are sold in the game  
6 and if all the tickets are cash in the game, the prize pool  
7 will equal this percentage of the gross revenue for the  
8 game.

9 The next column is just the game number again for  
10 my easy reference.

11 Column F, win count, is the number of times that  
12 Mr. Jaafar had filed a claim and been paid a claim for an  
13 individual game. So, I took from this -- from the previous  
14 document, I took the winnings per game and put them into  
15 this column.

16 Column G is -- so, everything from here on was  
17 calculated. It is just used Excel to do that. So, Column G  
18 is the number of tickets that would have been required to  
19 win the number of tickets in Column F. And I put in  
20 parentheses the columns and how I calculated those. So, that  
21 would be Column D times Column F. In other words, it is the  
22 odds of winning one prize of \$1,000 or more times the number  
23 of times that Mr. Jaafar won.

24 So, if we look at -- I'm just looking for the  
25 first one that is greater than zero here. Game number 25,





1 evidence.)

2 BY MS. HODGE:

3 Q If I could turn you to page number 6, please. On  
4 page 6, there is a box after the Excel spreadsheet which  
5 starts with, 'draw games only.' Can you explain this box to  
6 me?

7 A Sure. Actually, this is still part of the same  
8 Excel spreadsheet. All of the calculations are based on the  
9 same data. So, the box on the left where it says 'draw games  
10 only,' that's how many wins Mr. Jaafar had from the previous  
11 report relative to just draw games. So, there were 92 of  
12 those. Instant games only, there were 559. The total is 651.  
13 And the total won was \$1,024,000, which matches the last  
14 page of the previous report.

15 Q And the box next to it, can you explain that box  
16 for me?

17 A The one that is 'instant game only totals'?

18 Q Yes, please.

19 A That is the sum of all of the other columns. So,  
20 the sum of Column G, the sum of Column H, and the sum of  
21 Column I. So, that's the total number of tickets for him to  
22 have claimed prizes of \$1,000 or more on instant games only,  
23 for 559 of them, there would have had to have been the  
24 purchase of 2,283,649 tickets statistically to corroborate  
25 that 559 wins. That -- at that rate, that number of tickets,

1 the cost would have been \$15,455,688.99. And if you spent  
2 \$15 million dollars on those, all of those games, the  
3 expected win would be \$12,158,000. For all of them combined.

4 Q And inside this box where it says, 'purchases  
5 required,' can you explain that to me?

6 A Right. That's taking the total number of tickets,  
7 2,283,000 divided by -- if you look up the very top, next to  
8 the pay period. It says '184 days,' because the pay period  
9 for this was July 27, 2018 and January 27, 2019, that  
10 constitutes 184 days. So, just taking the 2,283,000 divided  
11 by 184, that means there would have had to have been a  
12 purchase of 12,411 tickets per day. Dividing that by 24  
13 hours in a day, you would have to purchase 517 tickets in an  
14 hour. Divided by 60, you would have to purchase 8.62 tickets  
15 every minute of every day 24 hours a day from the 27th of  
16 July until the 27th of January to substantiate these  
17 numbers.

18 MS. HODGE: No further questions.

19 MR. CONSIDINE: Thank you. I just have a couple.

20 CROSS EXAMINATION

21 BY MR. CONSIDINE:

22 Q Mr. Mandeville, could you give me your educational  
23 background post-high school?

24 A I have a Bachelor's Degree in mathematics,  
25 certifications in computer programming and a business

1 analysis and database analysis.

2 Q Would you tell me, is there is any particular  
3 model you have consulted in coming up with this spreadsheet?

4 A I referred to the prize structures in our instant  
5 games. And basically, all of those are available on our  
6 website. So, all of the statistics for all of the prize  
7 payouts for all of our games are available on our website,  
8 and that is exactly where I took these from.

9 MR. CONSIDINE: No further questions.

10 MR. MAYO: Anything further?

11 MS. HODGE: No. Thank you.

12 (The witness was excused)

13 MS. HODGE: If I can recall Maureen McHugh,  
14 please?

15 MAUREEN MCHUGH, recalled

16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

17 BY MS. HODGE:

18 Q Miss McHugh, Paul Mandeville testified that he  
19 prepared a document using Exhibit 2 which you had previously  
20 testified. Have you seen that document?

21 A Yes.

22 MS. HODGE: If I could hand her Exhibit 3, please?

23 BY MS. HODGE:

24 Q Do you recognize the document in front of you?

25 A Yes, I do.

1 Q What is it?

2 A It is the breakdown -- statistical analysis of the  
3 tickets and the games that Mr. Jaafar filed claims for.

4 Q Did the Compliance Department use this document in  
5 any way?

6 A Yes, we reviewed it.

7 Q What did you do after you reviewed it?

8 A Once we reviewed that, we determined based on that  
9 and this other document that it was factually -- was  
10 statistically improbable that Mr. Jaafar won all these  
11 tickets.

12 Q You determined it was factually improbable as  
13 well?

14 A Yes.

15 Q And did that lead to Mr. Jaafar being suspended  
16 from prize claims?

17 A Yes.

18 MS. HODGE: No further questions.

19 RE CROSS EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. CONSIDINE:

21 Q Miss McHugh, other than a violation of the  
22 high-frequency prize winner regulation indicated on 961 CMR  
23 2.43, is there any other regulation or law that the Lottery  
24 claims Mr. Jaafar violated?

25 MR. POLIN: Objection. It is not relevant to the

1 question that she is here to testify to. She is here to  
2 testify into the 961 CMR 2.43(2) high-frequency prize winner  
3 prize claim suspension. And if he is -- if my brother is  
4 getting into different questions of law of the legality of  
5 certain actions, that seems to be a question of law for the  
6 hearing officer.

7 MR. MAYO: I'll overrule the objection for the  
8 moment anyway. So you may proceed to answer the question.  
9 Duly noted.

10 BY MR. CONSIDINE:

11 Q Do you want me to restate the question?

12 A Yeah, can you ask it again, please?

13 Q As far as you know, other than a violation as  
14 alleged by the Lottery of the high-frequency prize winner  
15 regulation, are you aware of any other regulation or law  
16 that the Lottery claims Mr. Jaafar violated?

17 A I'm not aware. We were only looking at this one  
18 regulation at this time.

19 Q So, is it fair to say that the Lottery wasn't --  
20 as far as your investigation goes, the Lottery was not  
21 concerned whether there was any violation of Lottery  
22 regulations or law other than claiming high-frequency wins?

23 MS. HODGE: Objection.

24 MR. MAYO: I'm going to, again, overrule the  
25 objection but you are going far afield. She's already

1 testified that I think the purpose of the investigation was  
2 limited to the regulation at issue.

3 MR. CONSIDINE: And it seems to me I have every  
4 right to ask what she's aware of as part of that  
5 investigation.

6 MR. MAYO: You can proceed.

7 MS. HODGE: I renew my objection. Your question  
8 was about whether the Lottery was concerned about something  
9 else.

10 MR. CONSIDINE: Let me restate the question.

11 BY MR. CONSIDINE:

12 Q Are you aware of any other law or regulation that  
13 the Lottery was concerned about as it relates to a violation  
14 of the high-frequency prize winner regulation?

15 A Not at this time, no.

16 MR. CONSIDINE: Thank you.

17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

18 BY MS. HODGE:

19 Q Miss McHugh --

20 MS. HODGE: If I can just briefly?

21 MR. MAYO: One moment, please. Mr. Considine, any  
22 further questions?

23 MR. CONSIDINE: No.

24 MR. MAYO: Redirect.

25 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

1 BY MS. HODGE:

2 Q Do you work for the legal department?

3 A No, I do not.

4 Q Are you responsible for knowing all of the Lottery  
5 laws?

6 A No, I am not.

7 MS. HODGE: No further questions.

8 MR. CONSIDINE: Nothing.

9 (The witness was excused.)

10 MS. HODGE: No further testimony.

11 MR. CONSIDINE: We have nothing.

12 MR. MAYO: Mr. Jaafar?

13 MR. CONSIDINE: No, we have no questions. Other  
14 than his exhibits I gave you. I don't know if we marked  
15 them.

16 MS. HODGE: Is this the email?

17 MR. MAYO: There was an email and a letter, I  
18 believe. And if you could explain for the record,  
19 Mr. Considine, the purpose of your desire to enter these  
20 into the record.

21 MR. CONSIDINE: Sure. So, the first one which I  
22 guess would be Exhibit 4 is the letter dated April 26, 2019  
23 from Mr. Polin to me in response to a previous letter I had  
24 sent to him requesting notice of particular allegations to  
25 be made against Mr. Jaafar. The letter accurately restates

1 what I had requested in my previous letter, so I didn't see  
2 a need to be redundant there. 'A list of the witnesses to  
3 be called, copies of any documents or exhibits that were  
4 going to be used, and any legal standards to be applied.'  
5 And the response to the letter speaks for itself, of course,  
6 but basically, we got nothing. We didn't get a list of  
7 witnesses. We didn't get any indication of what the  
8 testimony was going to be. So, I'd like to introduce that  
9 letter as number 4. And --

10 MR. MAYO: Again, that letter is dated April 26?

11 MR. CONSIDINE: Yes, it is. And, then, as Number  
12 5, I'd like to introduce an email response from me to  
13 Mr. Polin in response to his letter. So, just those two  
14 exhibits.

15 THE COURT REPORTER: The date on these, please?

16 MR. CONSIDINE: Same date, April 26.

17 MS. HODGE: Other than relevance, I don't have any  
18 objection.

19 MR. MAYO: No objections from the Lottery?

20 MR. POLIN: I would like to point out the letter,  
21 the April 26th letter, it does state that, 'At the  
22 director-level hearing for the above-referenced individuals,  
23 the Lottery intend to present documents information which  
24 support the Compliance Department's determination to impose  
25 the prize claim suspensions. This information will include



1 but may not be limited to data relating to the  
2 above-referenced individual's Lottery prize claims since  
3 July 27, 2018 and the statistical odds of such claims.'

4 MR. MAYO: Duly noted.

5 (Exhibits 4 and 5 were marked into  
6 evidence.)

7 MR. CONSIDINE: I have nothing further, thank you.

8 MS. HODGE: If you would like closing?

9 MR. MAYO: If the Lottery like to close,  
10 certainly.

11 MS. HODGE: Very briefly, I believe that the  
12 Lottery has shown that Mr. Jaafar is under the definition  
13 from the regulation a high-frequency prize winner and well  
14 within its rights to suspend him for a period of 90 days. I  
15 can certainly brief that whenever I get the transcript.

16 MR. MAYO: Understood.

17 MR. CONSIDINE: I elect not to make any sort of  
18 closing argument. I just like to inquire again as to the  
19 schedule, post-hearing, that you laid out in the beginning  
20 just so I'm clear

21 MR. MAYO: My -- I think that from my standpoint  
22 we have a stenographer here. I would at least like to give  
23 the parties the opportunity to order a copy of the  
24 transcript for purposes of briefing me on what your closing  
25 position is. I spoke with the stenographer earlier, and she

1 indicated to me that it is two to three weeks before a  
2 transcript is produced. And my desire would be to have any  
3 of the briefs returned to me by Mr. Jaafar or the Lottery  
4 within one week after the transcript is produced. Is that  
5 fair?

6 MR. CONSIDINE: That's fair and fine with us.

7 MR. MAYO: If you need a day or two, that's one  
8 thing. I just want to get them back --

9 MR. CONSIDINE: And then once you receive the  
10 briefs, what should we expect in terms of the amount of time  
11 before we get any sort of notice?

12 MR. MAYO: I would expect that you will get a  
13 notice of decision from me within a week after that.

14 MR. CONSIDINE: Okay. Great. Thank you.

15 MR. MAYO: Nothing further.

16 THE COURT REPORTER: Off the record?

17 MR. MAYO: Yes.

18 (The hearing was adjourned at 11:06 a.m.)  
19

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

This is to certify that the attached proceedings  
before: State Lottery Commission

in the Matter of:

	)
ALI JAAFAR,	)
Respondent.	)
	)

Place: Dorchester, Massachusetts

Date: May 7, 2019

Were held as herein appears, and that this is the true,  
accurate and complete transcript prepared from the  
recordings taken of the above entitled proceeding.

<u>MaryAnn Rooney</u>	<u>05/07/19</u>
Official Reporter	Date

<u>MaryAnn Rooney</u>	<u>06/11/19</u>
Official Transcriber	Date